**ANM 328 Project 1 Critique**

Project one is a great introduction to the basic skills in Photoshop that you will typically use on most images you work with.  Whether you’re repairing a damaged photo or simply resizing a great digital image, Photoshop’s tools will help you understand its characteristics and offer you a smorgasbord of options to enhance or modify.

Regarding project grades:  I gave each project a level of difficulty rating from 1-10.  10 would be impossible to repair. If no repair work is required it would have a value of 1. My assessment of your final image and the level of difficulty are combined to make-up the project grade.

**Late projects** -10

**No Critique** -5 I check the critiques the day after they are due. No late critiques accepted.

95-100 Very successfully repaired major flaws and tonal deficiencies in a very challenging image

90-94 Image not as challenging but skillfully repaired flaws and exposure problems

85-89 Less challenging photo with minor flaws and tonal repairs. Mostly successful with repairs and adjustments

80-84 Photo is not very challenging. Repairs are minor and adjustments to tone and exposure are incomplete.

70-79 Photo not challenging. Flaws repaired but very minor. Does not demonstrate skill with the restore tools

**Note: My assessment of difficulty level is at the start of your critique: As a group, you all did a very good job with your image restorations. Many were outstanding, As you compare my comments with your grade, please realize that although the results may look perfect I take into consideration what skill it took to get there and how challenging I thought your image was to work with. The first number is the level of difficulty.**

**Adams Group**

Bowles-6/10 This is a beautiful old family photo that presented several challenges. The flaws at the top and the missing image areas at the bottom were the main problem areas. I gave is a slightly lower level of difficulty because the faces were clean (no major flaws that would be most difficult to repair). The repairs are very good with no obvious indication of being overworked. The levels adjustment has added tonal range and contrast and the addition of the sepia tone has brought the image back to its original period look. Very good work!

Johnson-6+/10 Your image has major creases across the sky and into the subject matter. Great job using he restoration tool to make them disappear. Because the larger subjects are clear the major flaws I considered it slightly less challenging. The tonal range could have been enhanced a bit with levels. I like to use the eye dropper in levels to set the black point. With black dropper click on darkest area like tree on right edge and then with white dropper set the white point with the whitest area, like the rider’s shirt. If you try this, you’ll see the highlights and shadows intensified.

Mehler-7+/10 My apologies for not getting your project uploaded in time for you to receive group comments. Your photo of the boy is very interesting…I’m wondering what decade this would be from. The level of difficult I assigned reflects the damage on his clothing, the background and most importantly the face. Repairing facial features is always the most challenging because of facial symmetry and our focus on the face. You’ve done a good job removing the slight discoloration in the print. This is very important so you don’t “clone-in” objectionable color with your repairs. The background looks very good…more abstract than the original which looks like a portrait photographer’s studio backdrop. The outfit also looks very good and I can see that you’ve enhance the tonal range/contrast go give the image more intensity. The flaws across the face were quite challenging and I can still see the remnants of the repairs. Repairs like this just require patience, zoom-in and most importantly know when to stop overworking an area.

Ruvalcaba-8/10 This image was in really bad shape with everything but a tire mark across it! With this degree of damage. I know it takes a lot of patience to clone-in good stuff over bad. The repairs in the foreground are especially well done. There’s still a flaw over the big girl’s sock,.but I’m being picky. The background in the top right (this looks like a photographer’s studio backdrop) still shows some of the crease marks over the dark lattice pieces. The faces were if good shape to start and you did a good job of setting the levels. I like the removal of the tint which it likely just due to age rather than being a sepia toned images. You got some great repair practice with this one! Nice!

Shroyer-7/10 It’s very tricky replacing areas that are partially obscured as I the bottom of your image and the light streak is really challenging. The light streak is typically cased during file loading where light has “leaked” onto the fil, Your cloning work looks very good! The orange highlight has been removed in the most obvious places. I still some slight tint under the eaves. The repairs at the bottom are a little “soft” and bleed over onto the margin of the print. I would like to have seen you clean that up. The best way to do this is to do a rectangular selection to the outside edge of the print, then hold down the option/alt key and make a second selection around the image area. This will result in a selection of just the border area. You can then recolor with white or even sample a value from the existing boarder that’s slightly off white and then fill or brush it into your border selection.

Yarnasaki-8/10 This looked like broken glass over the picture. I’ve seen several of these that, through age or moisture, the color emulsion has stuck to the glass and then gotten broken. This created significant challenges because the flaws are very harsh and crossed the baby’s face. Faces are always the most difficult to repair and typically, tend to be overworked. The little girl’s face looks good but there is a highlight on her cheek. To fix this I would recommend using the clone tool and pick-up color with a small brush diameter from the opposite cheek. There is still a “hint” of the crack across the dress below her arm. The baby’s lower lip and right cheek still have some hint of the repair. A good technique to use on lips is to do a selection of the good side, in this case the left, and copy/paste>flip horizontal and move the copy over the flawed area. You can clean-up any residual parts of the copy with the eraser/brush with 25% opacity. Very challenging…give the suggested “tips” a try!

Raynard-8/10 This is one of my favorite photos that I “loan” for this project. It’s a real first generation scan of a 1860’s civil war group. One of the things that interesting about is that some eyes look closed because of the long exposures needed for the old box cameras. This happens to affect the look of the eyes on the bottom center soldier and second from left at top. The best way to fix is to just clone eyes from one of the other faces. The subjects tend to look rather dower in these photo because photography was very new and for soldiers to have their image captured in a somewhat mysterious way was not necessarily a “happy” experience. They didn’t smile due to long exposers but they were also self-conscious about their bad teeth. Enough history!

Back to your repairs. Desaturating the image (removing all color) at the start helps remove odd color tints…this image would have originally been sepia toned. You’ve done an excellent job of removing all the hundreds of flecks and spots over the whole image. The background in the original is very uneven so while the restoration has some rather obvious “strokes” it’s not unbelievable. I know the repairs were very tedious but successful. The only area that I see that could be cleaned-up a bit better is the lip/chin of the soldier in upper right. Overall it looks very good.

**Mutter Group**

Bigelyaizen-7/10 Your photo had excellent resolution/detail which makes it somewhat easier to repair since you have good quality image area adjacent to creases and spots. The tonal range was weak but you did an excellent job of correcting. For my taste, the print may be a little dark which results in some loss of detail (man’s shirt collar on top right). Having said that the darker tone and sepia enriches the portrait. I’m wondering if this is a family photo that you can share? You’ve done a good job with repairs. The most challenging area is the girl’s face on bottom left where the crease crosses in midline…results are excellent!

Foster-7+/10 This is great old photo! They look so happy. As I’ve mentioned before, early photography required long exposers so the dower look was necessary to hold expressions and it was serious business. I really like the overall tonal improvement you’ve made. It has really brought the image to life. Repairs are excellent…I don’t see any residual indication that the photo was retouched! The woman’s face was likely the most challenging but the rest of the subject area was in pretty good shape. The backdrop has a painterly look, which is correct since these studio shots typically used painted scenes. Overall, you’ve done an excellent job.

McKinley-6+/10 This is great “authentic” cowboy picture. I suspect it was slightly blurred due to the movement of the horse at the instant of the exposure. There’s not really much we can do to sharpen that kind of motion blur. There weren’t a lot of challenging repairs to do. The tonal range was a little flat in the original and now looks much better, especially as it enhances the foreground detail of the horse. You had scratches and flecks to fix…they all look very good!

Rasbold-8+/10 This portrait was very challenging with many creases and cracking going across the woman’s face. The black and white repaired version looks very good…I can still see a spot under her nose and brighter “dot” on her nose. That bright spot might be a result of studio lighting. Considering the quantity of repair work, the face doesn’t look overworked. I like the fact that you challenged yourself with a recolor which looks much like the hand tinting of the 50’s. It’s interesting how just a hint of color highlights makes it look like a full color photo. Thanks for making the extra to create an extra image. I’m sure you learned a lot with these restorations.

Serou-7+/10 The left 2/3rds of the image was in good shape but the right side has some serious damage. In reality it would have been a better decision to crop to the ‘good stuff’ but you did need to show repair work. It looks like you tried your hand at the color balance which changes to tone of the background walls and warms-up skin-tones. Color adjustments are very subjective, especially on skin. When able, I try to first adjust to grass or concrete and then see how the skin-tones look. Back to repairs…I’m very impressed with your restoration of the sever damage on the lower right….walls are pretty easy but you had to recreate the piece in the background. It looks great! I don’t have much to quibble about…I there had been damage across the subjects, it would have been much more challenging.

Vyelkova-6/10 This is a cute portrait of the little girl holding flowers. Your original has an unusual texture which makes it more challenging. You have been successful in maintaining that texture across the image. The temptation might be to remove it but it would be too difficult and tedious. It’s better to embrace that feature and make sure it’s consistent, which you have done. The overall tonal range is much improved and the slight color in the original has been removed. There were flaws to repair but none crossed her face where restorations would be more obvious. There is a short bright streak in her forehead that could have been blended-in. Looking good!

**Monroy Group**

Arevalos-7/10 What a cute little girl! I tried to figure out what was in the foreground, but just couldn’t make sense of it.oh well! You had a few white flecks and streaks to repair and a few spots on her left cheek. The repairs look very good…especially on her face. Not sure why you left the boarder at the bottom of the final image. I would suggest just cropping that image..I assume you were just trying to make the images the same exact size.

Carey-7/10 Your original had a few flecks and spot damage on the baby and background. Those repairs look good and with no residual sign of manipulation. The blanket to the left really had a nasty area of damage and discoloration which now appears much more natural. My only suggestion to improve would be to try a slight adjustment to color balance to adjust the skin-tone, which is a little too warm in my opinion. This is a very subjective adjustment but worth a try. I would also recommend a levels adjustment to set the black and white points in the image to establish a wider tonal range.

Martin-8/10 This is a great old photo of a classic racer with lots of challenging repairs. I immediately notice the improved tonal range. All those creases and spots have magically disappeared! The only areas that look like they are overworked are the rear tire which is rough and the far back fence which is rather uneven and the transition to darker sky is rather abrupt. This is a tricky area to fix…the dodge tool can sometimes be used to lighten darker areas to make transitions smoother. Overall, a very good job with the myriad of repairs.

Phillips-8/10 Good job removing the discoloration in the original..this really helps when it comes to cloning out some of those flaws. There were lots of flaws, especially in the sky and over the left side of the car. The fixes look very good….the only area that appears overworked is the left side panel. As is it’s a little rough and wavy. The tonal range could be stronger..if you look at the histogram of the levels adjustment you’ll see that the white point could be reset to make the whitest whites, like his shirt, standout. I would also suggest setting the border in pure white. The best way to do this is to do a rectangular selection around the outside edge of the print, then hold down the option/alt key and make a second selection around the image area. This will result in a selection of just the border area. You can then recolor or brighten to pure white. I realize this was quite challenging, but know you learned a lot doing it.

R. Sanders-6+/10 This is a great old photo..perhaps a family member? The challenge with this photo was not so much about fixing flaws on the image but rather restoring the border and mounting. There was a smudge to fix (well done) but no significant blemishes on the subject. You’ve done a great job of restoring the matte background and I especially like the adjustment to tonal range which adds contrast to the portrait. The only think I notice is that there is still a hint of color in the oval white surround. The way to fix is to use the magic wand to select just the thin border. With it selected you can sample the sepia tone from the original picture (eyedropper) and then use that color to fill or brush-in the border. If it doesn’t look natural you can then adjust with the levels. Might be fun to try this.

Vyelkov-6+/10 Your original image had great tonal range and resolution. These features make it much easier to make the repairs. There was significant discoloration at the corners of the image and a number of spots and flecks to remove, both in the background and on the soldiers’ faces and uniforms. The repairs you’ve done look very good! I can still see the light area at the lower right of the images and there are still some spots on the right soldier’s uniform front and shoulder. I’m not sure what technique you used on the bright areas in the other corners but I would suggest trying the burn tool. It just takes a couple clicks to blend-in a highlighted area like this. Give it a try!

Montez-9/10 I’m not sure if this was an image you damaged for the sake of the project of if you actually found it in this condition…no matter. It was very challenging especially across the center girl’s face where the tear had to be rejoined. I can see an improvement in tonal range and somehow you’ve managed to remove the odd coloration on the girl’s hair to the left. It’s all good! I can still trace some of the path across center girl’s face where that mean tear went through. The area just above her right eye is perhaps most obvious. The background is much improved…looks like the interior of an airplane?

**Taylor Group**

Kauffman-5/10 Cute picture of a serious music fan! The only thing I see that needs fixing in your original is the tonal range…its rather flat because no black or white points are set. You have partially made this adjustment but I think you could take it one step further. Here’s the best way to set these points. Go to Adjustments>Levels and you’ll see three eyedroppers. Just take the black one (shadow) and point and click on the very blackest area of your image. I tried it with his sock. Then switch to the white eyedropper (highlight) and click on part of the subject that would be very white such as the center stripe on the wall or the white bulb on the lamp. You’ll see the tonal range and color of the image improve dramatically.

C. Sanders-7/10 This is a great professional portrait. You had a few flaws to work with but most were outside of the subject area. Those repairs look good. The overall tonal range of the image could be improved. Setting the black and white points with the levels adjustment will make a big improvement. See my note to Jeremy above for the details. By doing this you will bring out details and add depth to the image. This is a great technique you add to your Photoshop restoration skills.

Patton 8/10 I believe this was your second choice for starting image. It’s wonderful and maybe has some family significance. The image definitely had some flaws to deal with. Creases, tears, and missing corners all posed challenges. My first impression is that you’ve significantly improved the tonal range to much more effectively bring the subject into the foreground. You’ve also chosen to give the image an ethereal tone which befits the Scottish pipers who were, in earliest days, soldiers themselves. You’ve done a great job also with repairs…one of the most successful in class!

Stoddard-9/10 Your image was the most difficult image to repair in class. I suggested to you that it would be a challenge….I’m sure you realize that now. The final repaired image is still very dark and lacks contrast/tonal range. Now, there’s only so much you can do with all the texture that covers the whole image…I know that. The best strategy to start with is to remove all color with desaturation and then set the black and white points (see comments in your critique group members’ feedback). This strategy will at least get you to a point where you can see the flaws that are repairable. They won’t be hidden in the dark. Once any obvious repairs are done, you can then go back and tint to sepia tone that would have traditionally been used in this era which I think would be mid to late 1800’s and the early use of photography. You may have used some of these techniques in your restoration. This image was never going to be “pristine” again, but you can only do the best you can do.